Louis Stephen Du Plessis

THE MARKETS OF WARWICK: THE PARTICIPATION OF THE PUBLIC IN AN INFORMAL TRADING SPACE IN DURBAN

Keywords: Warwick market, informal trading, market spaces, area-based management, Durban, public participation process, self-generated management.

RYNKI W WARWICK: PARTYCYPACJA PUBLICZNA W NIEFORMALNEJ PRZESTRZENI TARGOWEJ W DURBANIE

Słowa kluczowe: rynek Warwick, nieformalny handel, przestrzenie targowe, zarządzanie oparte na strefach, Durban, proces partycypacji publicznej, samoorganizujące się zarządzanie.

Introduction

Spaces for trading have been at the centre of urban life for millennia. Aside from religious spaces (how we relate to the divine) and defensive spaces (how we relate to the outsider), trading spaces are arguably one of the most profound generators of the urban fabric. It is a space in which society interacts at its most profound – the space in which we relate to each other and on which our livelihoods as urban dwellers were generated for much of history. We need only to examine the ancient cities such as Athens and Priene with their Agora’s or Ancient Rome with their Markets of Trajan, or the medieval cities such as Krakow to see the fundamental place that the market place had in the civic life of those urban dwellers. Though in recent times, particularly post-industrialisation, the fragmentation of the urban fabric in conjunction with large scale capitalism has led to the decentralisation and rationalisation of significant trading spaces, open market places still serve a valuable purpose in the urban context.

The examination of the history of the Warwick Markets in the urban core of the city of Durban, South Africa, is a most illuminating one around the notion of public participation. Due to the city’s fairly recent establishment in the 19th century, the development of the markets of Warwick can be more easily tracked. Added to this, the impacts of the political systems of the day can be readily engaged with. From the onset, segregational policies of the Colonial and subsequent Nationalist governments had a profound impact in the area, shaping it dramatically. Post liberation in 1994, the local government engagement and management has been quite varied, at one stage their approach being lauded internationally, but more recently this ‘best practice’ example being abandoned, culminating in the public announcement in early 2009 to develop the
area into a strip mall to much outcry. This allows for an interesting and illuminating study of public participation as it relates to a market space.

1. Shared Context

The initial question raised here is why the comparison between the two seemingly disparate contexts of South Africa and Central Europe. The rationale is that both South Africa and many states in Central Europe share a commonality of a history of political restrictions when it comes to trade, specifically as it applies to open market areas (OMAs). Heavy restriction, such as limiting spaces and times of informal trade right through to criminalising and form of informal trade were common to both contexts and similarly, there has been an erosion to the hard-line approach over recent years. The fall of communism with its restrictions on trade in Central Europe and the transition to Democracy in South Africa in 1994 has had a profound change in the open market informal sector. With the hiatus in official ‘support’ for these areas for many years, both have had to deal with the notion of redressing a backlog of servicing and managing of market spaces.

2. Early Settlement arrangement

The medieval history of many European cities has led to a rather entrenched central open market areas, both within the physical space of the city fabric and also within the psyche of the population. There is not this same construct to draw upon in the historical city scope of South African cities, including Durban. Prior to the early settlement by European colonists in the 17th to 19th century, the extent of trade within the regions populations is difficult to quantify, but was clearly limited as settlements were relatively small and pastoral in set-up. (South African History Online, n.d.)

The founding of the settlement that was to develop into Durban was to occur in 1824 with the establishment of a simple ivory trading post. Though some previous European settlements at the site of the Bay of Natal occurred prior to this, it was mainly through shipwreck survivors along the coast that then subsequently abandoned their settlements. With the increasing settlement of the hinterland and the increased trade that was a natural result of this, Durban began to assume the characteristics of a sea-port town, but was essentially a cluster of primitive dwellings in a dispersed pattern and hidden in the bush during the early days of its establishment. (Rosenberg, et al., 2013, pp. 12-13)

Subsequent growth and character of the settlement demonstrated emphasis on the street amongst other aspects. In 1840, a town plan was commissioned that followed the traditional grid layout of South African town plans of the era, but with a focus on a central market square rather than the traditional church square, suggesting that Durban was to be a town dominated by trade. (Davies, 1963, p. 20) Prior to the 1850’s, this central market square was of little significance to the population (South Africa History Online, n.d.), but from the
late 1850's, 'Market Square' became the focus of religious, institutional and public buildings located around its edge for the growing settlement. (Rosenberg, et al., 2013, p. 13) Most of the trade in the mid-19th Century, however, was not based at this square, but rather towards the eastern and western edges of the settlement. (South Africa History Online, n.d.) This a result primarily due to segregation of race of traders, but also by convenience. The Square itself was mainly used for public gatherings, and eventually in 1863 became an ornamental garden. This racial segregation of trading directly led to the formation of the Warwick Markets, particularly with the more radical policies and laws implemented by the Colonial and subsequent Nationalist government in the early to mid-20th century.

3. Transport

Whereas many other market places have a strong tradition of being the spatial generator themselves around which other services and spaces are formed, the Warwick markets are intrinsically linked and dependent on the public transport infrastructure. The success of the trade in the area is dependent on the vast numbers of public commuters moving through the precinct every day. It is said to be one of the few places globally where informal trade at an upper level is successful – this is very much due to the transportation nature of the node and the arrangement thereof to accommodate it. It is therefore important to note the development and role of public transport in the area, particularly how the racial segregation thereof has been so profound therein.

The first form of public transport implemented in Durban was Trams in 1881 and were initially horse drawn and then converted to electrically motor driven in 1902. From inception to its phasing out in 1949, this service was subject to increasing measures of segregation based on race, and had it not being for the prohibitive cost and lack of economic viability, separate tram services would undoubtedly have been implemented. (Rosenberg, et al., 2013, pp. 37-39) Other forms of transport include the truck busses (Trucks converted to carry passengers), busses (both municipal and private carriers) and later minibus taxi operators (private carriers).

Truck busses were started in 1919 owned and operated by Indian individuals, responding to the needs for inexpensive public transport, specifically for certain racial groups. These businesses has subsequently morphed into using busses, but are still operational to this day. (Jackson, 2003) The nature of their routes and the subsequent legislated racial segregations of areas within the city meant that these services were initially set up to service non-european passengers, and as this spatial planning still has an overwhelming legacy on the composition of the city. These services are still used almost to exclusion of non-europeans.

The location of Berea Railway Station at the centre of the precinct is of particular importance to the success of the market activities. A large proportion of
the 460 000 daily users (Dobson et al., 2009, p. 5) make use of rail transportation through the station. There are at least 7 arterial routes on the Metrorail system that stop at this station. 2013 statistics still has the majority of commuters within the province of KZN dependent on the public transport nodes represented in the Warwick with 65.5% of trips done daily dependent on the transport nodes facilitated in the precinct. (Statistics South Africa, 2013, p. 95) This large numbers of travellers dependent on public transport converging at this point makes for a natural trading point, likely to continue indefinitely. Even with changes to the public transport dynamic over the last decade, such as an increase of 5% in the households who own or have access to private vehicles (Statistics South Africa, 2013, p. 85), the numbers of commuters using public transport remain fairly stable overall. The large numbers of commuters dependent on rail transportation is a legacy of apartheid era planning, where 'dormitory towns' were created away from the 'exclusive' inner city environment. People of colour were needed to provide cheap labour, but it was not 'desirable' to have them live in close proximity to the city. An added 'benefit' was that the need for people of colour to travel into the city meant that control of the population was much easier – protests could be contained to the townships and public transport nodes could be more easily policed. There is still an overwhelming concentration of the population that travels from the northern and southern former township areas (such as KwaMashu and Mlazi) using public transport. This lingering dependence on this transport node results in a concentration of potential customers, and due to the nature of the access to the station being elevated and the connecting buses and mini-bus taxi's being on ground level, the natural movement patterns allows for successful trading at multiple levels.

4. Warwick in history

Trade in the early years of the city was dominated by those of settler backgrounds, both white colonist descendants and Indian passenger individuals (those arriving from India of their own volition to seek private economic opportunities) and free Indians (those individuals brought across from India as indentured labourers and having completed their period of indenture) engaged in trading - the latter engaging in hawking or market gardens activities rather than returning to indentured labour. The government of the time quickly moved to legislate means to control trade based on racial lines. Different pieces of legislation that were enacted (such as the Indian Immigration law of 1895, Immigration Restriction Act of 1897, and the Wholesale and Retail Dealers Li-

---

1 These figures are published in 2009, there is no reason to think these have decreased in any way.

2 This is the term used for the underdeveloped, usually urban dormitory areas reserved for non-whites. It is usually located a fair distance outside of the urban core, an thus their residents are quite dependent on public transport.
encing Act of 1897) all demonstrate a concerted effort by officials to divide the town of Durban into areas of racially segregated traders from very early on in its existence. (Molyneux in Rosenberg, et al., 2013, p. 22) This resulted in the non-European owned and operated business core settling around the western edge of the original settlement, the Warwick markets now incorporated into this area. The Indian trading generally being more formal (occupying shops) and rural Africans more informal (setting up pavement stalls) (Dobson, et al., 2009, p. 43)

Throughout its history, this area was overwhelmingly dominated by non-white trade, but the declaration of the area as a slum in the 1930’s and subsequent legislation (The Group Areas Act of 1950, amended 1957 & 1966) was to affect the Warwick Market area dramatically. During the apartheid era, it was designated as a ‘European’ area in the apartheid planning process, and traders (both formal and informal) faced forced relocations to other areas. There were numerous attempts to enact the new laws in the area, but these were largely unsuccessful, trading was allowed to continue. By the 1960’s, street trading had been prohibited in the city and severe restrictions placed on informal trading in the designated markets. The banning of street trading was difficult to enforce, with local authorities ‘fighting a running battle’ with illegal traders. This issue was partially addressed with the passing of the Natal Ordinance in 1973, which allowed for severely limited trading, traders could only occupy a spot for 15 minutes before being required to relocate. The draconian laws of restrictive trading eventually started easing after the more liberal Progressive Federal Party came in to power locally in the early 1980’s. In reaction to a report on Hawkers (Informal Traders) in 1987, the council started to formally recognise the realities of the informal trading in the city and its contribution to the overall economy. (Dobson, et al., 2009, p. 45) This new attitude in approaching informal trade was to lead to a new management strategy implemented by the city in the area in the 1990’s.

5. Economic realities

South Africa has a rather high unemployment rate, with the official figure at the end of 2014 pegged at 24.3%. (Statistics South Africa, 2014, p. v), which is ranked at 28th highest in the world. (IndexMundi, 2014). This high unemployment figure puts a large strain on the social security network of the country, and while government pledges to increase employment rates, since 1996 the rate has consistently remained above 20%, peaking at 27.2% in 2002. (The World Bank, 2015). The nature of informal trading allows for many of these unemployed individuals to earn an income without access to formal employment or government assistance. This is clearly of great benefit to a country such as South Africa with such a high unemployment rate.

3 For comparison, Poland is ranked 70th on the list.
The most recent data puts the number of traders in the area between 5000 and 8000. Due to the informal nature of the activity, more accurate data is difficult to determine and is unavailable at this time. This data puts the average monthly earning of traders between R 1000 and R 8000.4 (Dobson, et al., 2009, p. 5) At the bottom end of the scale this is below South Africa’s minimum wage for the domestic worker sector5, but not significantly so with domestic workers earning between R1100 and R1800 per month based on the minimum rates. This demonstrates that at the higher end of the informal trading bracket, a rather decent income can be generated, though the numbers of traders earning at this level is rather minimal. Also taken into account South Africa’s high unemployment rate, the dependency rate of non-working adults to these earners is 2.9 to 1, significantly higher than the mean of around 1.4. (Business South Africa, 2003), the informal trade in Warwick supports over 30 000 adults of working age, not including dependents excluded from the labour force.

6. Specific Context of Warwick Junction Markets

Due to its rather organic and somewhat unregulated history, the area of Warwick incorporated numerous markets of unique individual character. This has resulted in a complex grouping of trading places with a highly ordered system of operation. In formalising a tourism initiative for the markets of Warwick, 10 distinctive and individual markets with their own speciality trading were identified for inclusion in the urban area initiative6. These formal market places also include numerous street traders along their periphery.

Many of the traders are supported by a labour intensive system, thus increasing the employment created in the area. Though seemingly haphazard, there is a complex and highly organised system, most prominently the goods porters and water bailiffs. Goods Porters will store individual traders’ goods overnight and deliver them to their trading location prior to their trade starting. Deliveries from collection points and wholesalers continue throughout the day, so the porter trolleys are a constant sight throughout the day. In addition, the council supplies potable water at limited specific locations in the area. These points are secured and leased out to the water bailiffs. They will in turn sell water to traders and ensure delivery thereof. The council meters the water

4 This equates to about USS$80 – USS$660 at the May 2015 exchange rates.
5 The South African Department of Labour issues periodic updates of minimum wage rates, and these are specific to industry, nature of employment and area. It is therefore difficult to determine a mean minimum wage, therefore the domestic worker figures are used as a benchmark due to similar skill level requirement and nature of employment. (Department of Labour - Republic of South Africa, 2015)
6 The Markets of Warwick include Victoria Street Market; Bond Street Market; Pinfors/Deed Sellers Market; Herb Traders/Traditional Medicine Market; Badsha Peer; Berea Station Market; Music Bridge; Fresh Produce Market/Early Morning Market; Bovine Head Cookers/Traditional Foods market; and the English Market.
consumption and charges for this. (Dobson, et al. 2009, p. 117) What this does allow for is another stream of employment within the market that is not having to be operated by the local council and extensive civil infrastructure is not required.

The complex system of trading in the area is not only influenced by the support network, but also by time and specialities. The more entrepreneurial traders of general items will vary product according to time of day and sometimes even location. Early morning trade is dominated by foodstuffs that can be consumed on the go for breakfast – typically this entails fruit or small packets of goods such as chips. After the morning rush, more general goods become more prominent, such as hardware and household goods [locks, batteries, super glue, soap, beauty cream]. When the foot traffic patterns change once again in the afternoon when commuters are returning home, foodstuffs (such as vegetables) become more available.

On the other end of the spectrum, the Warwick Junction Area is also known for speciality items, some of which people from around the province will specifically travel to the markets to purchase. Pinafore sellers are located in the Brooke Street Market, renowned for their reasonably priced and well-made traditional, religious and workers attire. They not only sell from this location, but there are small spaces for rent from the council that allows for their manufacture. In close proximity is the Clay Wholesalers, who mine their clay in a rural area two hours travel from Durban. The clay is used in traditional practices, and is not generally traded elsewhere in the city.

Though generally harmonious in their trading activities, there is a delicate balance of individual and market based interests maintained. International research suggests that open market areas are a space in which ethnic barriers are not as defined as the city as a whole, and the association across social boundaries is more likely to take place here than in the surrounding communities. (Sik & Wallace, 1999, pp. 17-18). This too is the case at the Warwick markets, but not dramatically so. Concentrations of foreign traders are usually found in the more popular tourist areas of the city, and usually based on the manufacture and sale of art and curios. Much of the trade here is by locals, and foreigners sometimes receive a chilly reception. Some foreigners are more innovative in their trading than locals, and more willing to reduce profit margins. This does not always endear them to the local traders, and hostilities sometimes surface. (Dobson, et al., 2009, pp. 31-33). Hostilities are not only reserved between different ethnic groups, but also between markets and racial groups. The status quo is seen to be suitable and developed organically over time – changes to services offered, introduction of different goods or amenities added that may alter the trading dynamic between the different markets is met with scepticism and resistance. New endeavours are cautiously and sometimes fleetingly embraced as the interests of the individual markets are heavily weighted by their relative representatives as opposed to the greater good of the collec-
tion of markets. (Pettersson & Manning, 2001, p. 9). In recent proposals to demolish some of the markets to construct a mall development, racial incidences between local traders flared up. (KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government, 2009) This is unsurprising in a sense, since the entire precinct was developed originally along racial segregation, and though more than 20 years into the democratic era, these outwitting of spatial and racial legacies will still haunt us as a country. Having said this, there is a strong sense of community within the individual markets, and instances of tremendous goodwill between traders abound.

7. Recent Management

Post 1994, there was a concerted effort at affecting an entirely new way of managing the markets and engaging with the traders at the need and will to engage with transformation was great. Years of neglect, congestion and poor planning needed to addressed, and rather radically at that. This next section highlights certain key aspects around the renewal project, but for a more comprehensive picture, readers are referred to Dobson, Skinner and Nicholson’s Working in Warwick – Including street traders in urban plans.

Initially, post 1994, work had already started on the upgrading of infrastructure in the area. The Warwick junction Urban Renewal Project main founding principle was working with, rather than against, the interests of street traders. (Dobson, et al., 2009, p 47) This worked well with the numerous representative trader organisations that had been active in the area from the 1980’s onwards. One of the more prominent organisations was the Self Employed Women’s Union (SEWU), modelled on the similar organisation in India. It particularly lobbied for the concerns of women traders, who are estimated to make up about 60% of street traders in South Africa. (Dobson, et al., 2009, p. 11). These existing representative bodies meant that community representative structures were already in place to engage with around the Urban Renewal Project.

In 1996, there was a concerted effort to engage in a large scale operation as day to day servicing was not clearing the backlog of issues. This resulted in the need to disrupt the traders temporarily. To minimise the disruption, different municipal departments (such as waste disposal, health, policing, small enterprise development and transport) needed to closely co-ordinate their activities in this initial project. These activities then also needed the co-operation of the traders, which led to interactions taking place based on engaging existing community groups. This inter-departmental co-operation in addition to community engagement was quite successful and became the foundation off of which subsequent interventions were managed. (Dobson, et al., 2009, p. 49)

As the Urban Renewal Project gained traction, it became part of a city-wide experiment with integrated area-based management, where planning and management Area based management. The project management option chosen was
a team that was directly under the city council. This enabled the team to more easily access technical and human resources throughout the council; to foster a greater sense of co-operation between departments; and individual officials (some quite experienced and senior in council departments) to be identified, involved and held accountable from the start of the project. Due to the ‘personal’ involvement of dedicated officials, the area and project dynamics were more quickly understood and a more collaborative engagement fostered between project member themselves and between the team and the community.

"The Council afforded informal traders the opportunity to participate on a sustained and continuous basis in negotiations about their needs and priorities," said one trader. This was conducted, "in a low key way, often on an issue-by-issue basis". Sustained interaction with the traders in a participatory manner allowed the project to build on the energy and dynamism of what was already there. Finally, the Warwick experience demonstrates the advantages of an area based approach to management of the informal economy. (Skinner & Dobson, 2007)

This particular hand-on and broadly collaborative approach allowed for a more ‘organic’ type of development plan to evolve for the area, as the constant input from various stakeholders and live feedback from implemented interventions could be easily taken into account. The two project fundamentals were that of Area-based and Inter-departmental management; and the commitment to participation and consultation. (Dobson, et al., 2009, p. 59) The operating objectives were seen as a series of tasks that needed to be completed rather than the operation of a large project. Of particular note in this collaborative approach was the approach that the Area Based Manager for the project took. They would spend 2 – 3 hours a day observing and interacting with the traders on the ground, gaining valuable insights and building trust with them. (Bukka, 2013). This was also linked to the fact that the project headquarters were located in the Precinct rather than at existing council offices. A derelict building was renovated for this purpose, and not only did this give the team easy access to the community, but also tangibly demonstrated the project’s commitment to the area from the onset.

Unfortunately, after the great successes of the 6 phases of the Urban renewal project, the Municipality’s approach to the precinct management started to shift in the early 2000’s. The consultative and collaborative approach started to diminish, replaced by a more authoritarian approach – the great gains made being eroded away and the internationally acclaimed approach slowly abandoned. In 2008, Axiwe eTafeleni, a non-profit organisation, was formulated by Richard Dobson and Patrick Ndlovu, two former project team members. This was in response to their concerns over the widening gap between the council’s agenda and the realities of local informal traders. (Axiwe eTafeleni, 2013) This concern was well founded, as in March 2009, the city made public their intentions to displace informal traders and demolish some of the thriving market areas to make way for a commercial mall development, with the then mu-
municipal manager citing the spatial and servicing 'chaos' of the area as the motivation for the R400 million development. This plan was formulated in isolation from the community (specifically the approximately 3000 workers dependent on the livelihoods they earn in these markets), with the first public 'interaction' being the publication of their intention via public notice in a local newspaper. (Dobson, 2011) This sparked the beginning of a rather unpleasant saga. Tensions between council and traders, and between traders themselves were heightened dramatically, sadly much of it along racial lines. Council was accused of duplicity and heavy handedness, stringent policing of permits, confiscation of goods and even locking traders out of market spaces illegally.

_Durban had been wrong to try to close down the Warwick Junction market and move traders into a new mall. It stopped listening to its own people before international input in the run-up to the 2010 World Cup, a top eThekwini Municipality architect admitted on Monday to delegates attending the XXV International Union of Architects World Congress now under way in Durban._ (The Mercury, 2014)

The ramifications of this great public outcry required the intervention of the Provincial (state) government. The growing public disquiet and lack of trust in the local authority required the Provincial Premier to formulate a task team to address the issue and report on it. The plans for the R400mil mall seem to have officially been abandoned, with full council sitting on 29 January 2014 asked to approve plans for upgrades to the markets precinct that did not include the mall. (Daily News, 2014). As quietly as the Mall development was proposed, so too has it discontinued.

8. Public Participation framework

Following on from the previous section discussing the nature of recent management and relationships between the local authority and the traders, the current legal and procedural framework for public participation in general needs to be examined. This shall be looked at by examining the brief global context, then followed by the specific South African context. What is quite evident in the policies and principles is the need for a meaningful public participation framework, not only for the notion of including the general populace, but in providing a framework for broad based beneficial development to occur. A general comment around public participation is that it takes the form of 3 levels, namely Public Communication (municipality giving information to other stakeholders), Public Consultation (Stakeholders providing information to the council); and Public Dialogue (mutual exchange of information). (Rowe, 2005). This indicates that the process is mainly about information sharing, the focus on having a meaningful stake in the decision making is not well defined.

In June 1992, the United Nations Conference on the Human Environment released their Rio Declaration on Environment and Development, containing 27 Principles with the goal of "...establishing a new and equitable global par-
nership through the creation of new levels of cooperation among States, key sectors of societies and people” (United Nations Environment Programme, 1992). These principles built upon an earlier conference on the Human Environment held in Stockholm in 1972, and mainly focus around the interaction between states and their role in environmental management for sustainable development, but there is also a strong sense of community participation being encouraged. Principle 10 specifically talks about communities having appropriate access to information and the opportunity to participate in decision-making processes, with states facilitating the process. This global context, in addition to a new political dispensation in South Africa mere two years later has shaped the public participation processes followed here.

In the South African context, the current broad framework is based on the constitutional requirement for community involvement in local government activities. The Constitution of South Africa Section 152 (1) (e) states that mechanisms should be in place “to encourage the involvement of communities and community organisations in the matters of local government.” (Constitutional Assembly - Republic of South Africa, 1996, p. 74). This constitutional requirement is quite understandable as an attempt to redress the authoritarian approach of previous governments in dealing with community issues.

On a provincial (state) level, the South African Local Government Association has also released guidelines in 2013 on public participation to local authorities. These guidelines state that the principle behind public participation is that ‘all the stakeholders affected by a public authority’s decision or actions have a right to be consulted and contribute to such a decision’. Further, the local authority is obligated to take into account the interests and concerns of the residents when it crafts by-laws, policy and implements its programmes; to communicate to the community regarding its activities and to develop and annually review mechanism to consult and involve the community (South African Local Government Association, 2013, pp. 1 - 2). The rights of the local community in this framework though are fairly non-committal on the local authority in a sense. Community members can “contribute to the decision-making process”, but within the bounds of the provided mechanisms this basically entitles members to lobby political office bearers and be entitled to ‘reasonable’ information being supplied by the local authority. (South African Local Government Association, 2013, p. 4)

The eThekwini Municipality has a published policy on public participation. The participation program has five strategic goals, namely: Effecting behavioural change in elected representatives and council officials to work with communities; ensuring the public have consistent access to political and administrative structures; creating a framework of government accountability and

7 eThekwini Municipality is the Metropolitan authority created in 2000 of which the city of Durban was one of the local authorities subsumed to create it.
public involvement in planning and budgeting processes: Promoting consumer responsibility and care of facilities and services; and establishing and sustaining community based programs. (eThekwini Municipality, 2006, pp. 6-7). In addition to this, additional policy voices the local authority's stated goal for “…citizens to utilize their full potential and access opportunities, which enable them to contribute towards a vibrant and sustainable economy with full employment…” (eThekwini Municipality - Transformation Office, 2001, p. 6).

The principles spoken about at international, National and Local level are quite lofty and clearly promote the participation of the ordinary citizen in the urban infrastructure provision realm. The practicalities and the outworking of these policies and principles are however in this instance that community members are usually permitted to lobby elected representatives and hope that the elected representatives take their input seriously. There is very limited, if any, direct control or meaningful stake in the decision making process. This is highlighted by numerous aspects, one of which is the very recent call by stakeholders in the Provincial built environment fraternity\(^6\) starting the process of lobbying National government for a Citizen Planning Commission.

**Conclusion and recommendations**

The Warwick Precinct is a particularly interesting market area to study. It’s unique history and context in a relatively short period of existence gives us great insights. For the majority of its existence, has been subjected to segregational planning and policy decisions that continues to have a dramatic effect on the marginalised sector of the community it caters for. It is also precinct that is organic in nature and is very much dependent on the transport systems that interface with it. Recent (post 1994) strategies can particularly inform us of different approaches to this particular context. The short period of Area-based management of the precinct gives an example of a strikingly different approaches of local authority management followed and the successes achieved thereby while that approach was in place. In concluding, the discussion can be easily divided into Municipal Management Structure; Community engagement; And Architectural Implications, and implications easily drawn from that.

**Municipal management structure**

The approach to Area based management as a city-wide experiment worked well in the Warwick Precinct. It allowed for different senior department officials to be on site for the duration of the project as they were housed within the

---

\(^6\) Recently, The South African Institute for Architects – KwaZulu-Natal region hosted the ‘We Design 2016’ national conference with the aim of ‘Calling for a National Spatial Revolution’. The think-tank working groups following on from this conference will be lobbying National Government for a Citizens Planning Commission to be established and be replicated at municipal levels to allow for citizen involvement in budget planning, as well as spatial design.
precinct. This allowed for decisions to be taken and implemented more easily and for the project team to be to be fairly consistent. Individuals could build trust with the local community and gain a greater level of understanding for the ever-changing dynamics of the area. The collaborative management and intervention approach, attached with keen and extensive on-site observations was the cornerstone of the successful Urban Renewal Project.

Community

The community engagement (as opposed to merely consulting) is a slow process, but one that is necessary for successful interventions. There is a need to include both formal and informal discussions with a variety of stakeholders, and the need for concerted follow-ups to take place. The culture of consensus and discussion is a slow process followed, but particularly in the cultural context where lengthy discussions and processes are the norm in many community cultures in South Africa, it is successful. The major aspect to remember in the discussions is that the decision makers need to recognise that many ‘formal’ discussion participants have their own interests to pursue. The formal consultation must be coupled with the informal and keen personal observation to ensure a more accurate understanding of the interventions required and the method of implementing them. Added to this, the community does not react well to changes in a process that is working well in their minds – once an established ‘protocol’ is in place, trust is easily broken should that protocol be significantly changes or abandoned. The process should also seek partnerships across the spectrum of society.

Architectural interventions

Quite frequently, small and experimental interventions need to be considered first. This will allow for a fairly tight public participation process to be followed and later built and extended upon. The smaller interventions will also give a better understanding to the context of the area, and unexpected consequences (whether positive or negative) can be dealt with in a more inclusive manner without extensive investment having taken place which may turn out to be less successful. Interventions need to be supportive to the current social dynamics of the area, and need to balance individual needs with broader precinct needs and objectives.

Bibliography

1. Asiye eTafuneni, 2013, Our Story. [Online]


**Streszczenie**


**Information on the author:**

Louis Stephen Du Plessis, PhD candidate,  
Durban University of Technology,  
Faculty of Engineering and the Built Environment,  
Department of Architecture,  
e-mail: LouisD@dut.ac.za